

# Impact of salt, drought, heat and frost stresses on morpho-biochemical and physiological properties of *Brassica* species: An updated review

Sohail Ahmad Jan<sup>1,2\*</sup>, Nazma Bibi<sup>3</sup>, Zabta Khan Shinwari<sup>4,4</sup>, Malik Ashiq Rabbani<sup>2</sup>, Sana Ullah<sup>5</sup>, Abdul Qadir<sup>5</sup> and Nadar Khan<sup>2</sup>

**ABSTRACT** Abiotic stresses seriously impact crop productivity and agro-morphological and biochemical properties of all *Brassica* species. It also decreases the yield of many important *Brassica* species by disturbing their normal growth and development. In this review, we have highlighted the latest reports about the impact of different abiotic stresses on different growth stages and other morpho-physiological processes of important *Brassica* species such as canola/rapeseed (*Brassica napus*), indian mustard (*Brassica juncea*), *Brassica oleracea* and *Brassica rapa*. Several researchers reported that abiotic stresses affect the important morpho-biochemical processes such as shoot and root length, shoot fresh and dry weight, proline and relative water contents, chlorophyll amount, antioxidant enzymes activity of important *Brassica* species. These stresses also disturb normal oxidative processes that lead to cell injury. The genetic modification approaches for the development of transgenic plants against these environmental extremes have been described. The present study will be useful to identify the best abiotic stress tolerant *Brassica* genotypes for further genetic engineering program and crop improvement programs.

**Keywords:** Abiotic stresses, *Brassica* species, Morpho-biochemical, Transgenic *Brassica* species

<sup>1</sup>Department of Biotechnology, Quaid-i- Azam University, Islamabad, Pakistan

<sup>2</sup>Plant Genetic Resources Institute (PGRI), National Agricultural Research Centre (NARC), Islamabad, Pakistan

<sup>3</sup>Department of Genetics, Hazara University Mansehra, Pakistan

<sup>4</sup>Pakistan Academy of Sciences, Islamabad, Pakistan

<sup>5</sup>Department of Botany, Hazara University Mansehra, Pakistan

\*Corresponding author: Sohail Ahmad Jan (sjan.parc@gmail.com; sohailahmadjan3@gmail.com)

**To cite this article as:** Jan, S. A., Bibi, N., Shinwari, K. S., Rabbani, M. A., Sana Ullah, Qadir, A., & Khan, N. (2017). Impact of salt, drought, heat and frost stresses on morpho-biochemical and physiological properties of *Brassica* species: An updated review. *Journal of Rural Development and Agriculture*, 2(1), 1-10.

## INTRODUCTION

Abiotic stress affects the growth, development, yield and other physiological characters of different *Brassica* species. The effect on these characters is directly correlated with economically yield loss of crop plants. Various researchers conducted studies to screen the abiotic stress tolerant *Brassica* genotypes for further study in environmental stress affected areas. The detailed information about the effect of all sort of abiotic stresses on important *Brassica* species is given below:

### Effect of salt stress on important properties of *Brassica* species

Salt stress is one of the major abiotic stresses that affects plant growth and its production (Allakhverdiev et al., 2000; Hasanuzzaman et al., 2017; Nejat & Mantri, 2017). About 20% of our cultivated lands and 50% of crop land are highly affected by salt stress (Lakhdar et al., 2009). It is estimated that more than 50% of our arable lands will be affected by this type of stress by the year 2050 (Wang et al., 2003). This stress can be determined at time when plant death occurs or when it badly affects its morpho-physiological process. However, the abiotic stress tolerance varies with plant species/sub-species. Therefore, development of abiotic stress tolerant varieties is so important (Zheng et al., 2009). Salt stress affects both the qualitative and

quantitative characters of important *Brassica* species such as canola (*Brassica napus* L.), Indian mustard (*Brassica juncea* L.), cabbage (*Brassica oleracea* L.) and turnip rape (*Brassica rapa* L.). The diploid nature of *Brassica rapa* is more sensitive to salt stress as compared to other polyploid species i.e. *B. napus* (Farhoudi et al., 2015; Kumar, 1995). The high salt concentration in soil and irrigation water decreases the germination rate of almost all *Brassica* species. Sometime plant germination can occur but shows stunted growth and poor development (Zamani et al., 2010). So, it is important to identify and characterize improved genotypes against these environmental extremes (Almodares et al., 2007; Islam & Karim, 2010).

Salt stress affects the N (nitrogen) uptake and its assimilation process in many plant species. The high level of salt affects various enzymes of *B. juncea* such as nitrite reductase (NiR), glutamine synthetase (GS), glutamate dehydrogenase (GDH) and asparagine synthetase (ASN) (Siddiqui et al., 2009). It also disturbs plant biomass, root and shoots length, CO<sub>2</sub> assimilation rate of *B. juncea* (Ahmad et al., 2012). The other morpho-biochemical and physiological processes such as growth rate, chlorophyll contents, leaf area index, flower abortion and N, K and P contents are also significantly affected in many *Brassica* species (Hayat et al., 2009).

Canola shows moderate level of resistance to salinity. But, its growth and productivity are highly affected by different salt concentrations (Lomonte et al., 2010). Salt affects the photosynthetic rate, growth and sodium (Na<sup>+</sup>) ion accumulation and distribution in leaf area of two important canola genotypes (NYY 1 and BZY 1). The plant dry biomass, overall photosynthesis, Na<sup>+</sup> level and net water potential rates in leaf area were higher in genotype NYY 1 as compared to other genotype (BZY 1). However, the %Na<sup>+</sup> content in leaf symplast remained higher in genotype NYY 1. The moderate salt level (3 g/kg) has slight effects on the stomatal conductance. While high salt levels (6 and 9 g/kg NaCl) significantly affects the assimilation rate due to stomatal and non-stomatal limitations and leads leaf necrosis and stunted growth. The high salt resistant potential in genotype NYY 1 is due to low accumulation of Na<sup>+</sup> in shoot area confined Na<sup>+</sup> to the apoplast area thus lowering leaf toxicity. This is one reason that genotype NYY 1 shows more tolerance than that of BZY 1. Hence salt tolerance response varies with the type of genotype (Yang et al., 2012). The shoot, root fresh and dry weights of canola plants decreased with all salt stress levels (50, 100, 150 and 150 mmol) (Sergeeva et al., 2006). Similarly, the percent relative water contents 24 hours also decline with the increasing NaCl levels (0, 100, 150, 200, 250 and 300 mM) in many important canola cultivars. It means that water loss from leaves occur at high rate at elevated NaCl concentration (Dai et al., 2009).

Elevated salt concentrations (12 and 15 dSm<sup>-1</sup>) significantly decreased the germination rate, root shoot length and seedling dry weight many folds of kohlrabi (*Brassica oleracea* var. *gongyloides*). While it showed good morpho-physiological performance at up to 9 dSm<sup>-1</sup> NaCl (Biswas et al., 2016). Kandil et al. (2016) reported that salinity stress affects all the ten tested canola genotypes. However, the salt tolerance level varied among genotypes. The cultivar Screw 6 showed excellent morphogenic response for all quantitative traits like root/shoot length and root/shoot fresh and dry weights. While cultivar Screw 51 gave better seedling height, total chlorophyll contents and relative dry weight. However, these characters were highly affected at high NaCl concentration (1.8%). Umar et al. (2011) also observed different type of responses at different salinity levels of many imported *B. rapa* genotypes. The abiotic stress decreased the amounts of chlorophyll a, b and a+b up to several folds of *B. napus*, *B. juncea* and *B. rapa* genotypes (Alam et al., 2014).

Salt stress also affects the growth and total fatty acid (TFA) contents of many important *Brassica napus* genotypes. The plant biomass was decreased by 25 and 35% at high NaCl levels (100 and 150 mmol). The overall decrease in biomass occurred by 55% at very high salt stress (200 mmol) in all canola genotypes. The overall TFA value was decreased by 25% with increasing of salt stress from 0 to 200 mmol. It might be due to membrane lipid degradation at high stress level. More interestingly, the poly-unsaturated fatty acids decreased, while the mono-unsaturated fatty increased with the rise of salt stress. The oleic acid, palmitic acid, linoleic acid and linolenic acid optimum concentrations were significantly disturbed by saline condition (Bybordi et al., 2010). The increase level of degradation of important secondary metabolites (glucosinolates) occur with the increase level of salt stress, due to membrane damage/high relative electrolyte leakage. The high glucosinolates content was observed in *Brassica oleracea* L. var. *italica* after NaCl (40 and 80 mM) stress for two weeks. The same trends were also recorded for *B. rapa* after subjecting NaCl levels (20, 40 and 60 mM) for five days (Lopez-Berenguer et al., 2008). These abiotic stresses may change the defense mechanism of many important *Brassica rapa* germplasm (Steinbrenner et al., 2012). Salt stress affected the growth and other important enzymatic activity of three important canola genotypes (Consul, Zarfam and Okapi). The

growth decreased by several folds but the rate of Catalase (CAT) and Peroxidase (POD) increased many folds with the increase of salt concentration from 0 to 120 mmol. The cultivar Opaki showed more salt tolerance and maximum enzymatic activities; CAT (14.2 mgH<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>/g.pro/min)/POD (63.4 mgH<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>/g.pro/min) as compared to other two cultivars at 120 mmol NaCl (Farhoudi et al., 2015).

Salts stress severely affects different plant species at early germination and seedling growth stages by disturbing their various agro-morphological and physiological processes (Su et al., 2013). Torabi & Ardestani (2013) reported that salinity and drought stress affected the morpho-biochemical processes of important canola genotype Opaki at germination stages. The seeds were germinated at 0, -0.1, -0.2, -0.3, -0.4, -0.6 and -0.8 MPa NaCl and PEG-6000 concentrations. The maximum germination frequency (72%) was obtained at controlled condition (0 MPa) and it decreased up to 26.1% at -0.8MPa for NaCl and PEG. The 50% maximum germination value was estimated for 50.4 h at 0 MPa and increased to 62.5 and 123.7 h at -0.8 MPa concentrations. Salinity causes reduction in average yield, oil contents and other growth performance of many important *Brassica* species. It has adverse effect on plant morphology and other morpho-physiological processes (Su et al., 2013; Jan et al., 2016).

### **Impact of heat stress on morpho-physiological properties of *Brassica* species**

High temperature stress disturbs normal plant growth and development, especially at the early stages of plant growth, which is one of the major problems in many cultivated areas of the world. The high heat stress retards the normal agronomical, morphological, biochemical and physiological processes of many different plant species and causes severe yield loss. It also affects many *Brassica* species including important canola oilseed crop at early growth stage. The increase in levels of ascorbate peroxidase and gene expression in canola hypocotyl occurs at high temperature. However, ascorbate peroxidase levels increased for a short period upon high temperature stress. The up-regulation of these proteins play key role in energy and metabolic processes and can help to provide maximum nutrients to early seedling at high temperature (Ismaili et al., 2015). The optimum temperature for *Brassica napus* germination is 28 °C and any temperature above this level retard its growth and development (Kaya et al., 2006). The effect of low to high temperature gradient on plants generally depends on some important factors like anti-oxidant enzyme concentrations, plant species/ cultivar used, type of organs, time period of exposure, magnitude of stress and growth stages (Lu et al., 2008; Zhang et al., 2015). Similarly, the proline content increases with rise of heat stress. Proline protects the proper protein structure from denaturing, stabilizes the cell membrane by interacting with phospholipid bilayer and maintains the osmotic pressure between cytoplasm and environment (Claussen, 2005). On the other hand, the decrease in chlorophyll content was recorded at unfavorable temperature (Gupta et al., 2013; Shah et al., 2015).

Temperature above 27 °C leads to floral sterility and yield loss of many economically important *Brassica napus* cultivars. The high heat stress at vegetative growth stage leads to low flower number in all three important *Brassica* species (*B. rapa*, *B. juncea* and *B. napus*). The yield significantly increased with the increase of flower number. The loss of yield was due to reduced seed size per flower. Therefore, heat tolerance genotypes are important to achieve maximum flower numbers and healthy seed size (Morrison & Stewart, 2002). The *B. carinata* shows poor germination and early seedling growth at high heat stress. Therefore, proper inter/intra-specific hybridization methods are important to develop new heat tolerant *Brassica* species. New alien genes introgression can be used for the improvement of many important *Brassica* species (Deol et al., 2003).

The flower and grain filling stage are more sensitive for temperature stress. It affects pollen viability, grain development, anthesis time and fertilization process. The high thermal stress at terminal growth stage affected normal photosynthesis process, transpiration rate, stomatal conductance, mean productivity and geometric mean productivity, and important yield characters of 43 important rapeseed germplasm. A 20% reduction in plant yield was recorded in many genotypes. The rapeseed mustard genotypes, BPR-549-9, BPR-540-6 and BPR-349-9 showed more heat tolerance at terminal growth stage and gave better yield and other morpho-physiological response than that of other accessions (Singh et al., 2014). The elevated level of temperature increased the transpiration rate and stomatal conductance, and decreased the water use efficiency and chlorophyll content of Chinese cabbage (*Brassica campestris* subsp. *napus* var. *pekinensis* cv. Detong) (Oh et al., 2014).

### Effect of frost stress on physiological properties of *Brassica* species

The frost stress is one of the key environmental extremes that affects the yield and other agronomic important characters of many crop plant species (Singh et al., 2008; Shah et al., 2016). The canola crop is very sensitive to frost stress especially at reproductive stages. The spring and winter temperature affect some of the important steps during the reproductive period like gametogenesis, pollination, fertilization and embryogenesis (Angadi et al., 2000). The low temperature leads to few mature seeds formation due to poor pollen formation (Jinling, 1997). Frost stress at early seedling stages causes death of the whole canola plant. The damage of frost stress mainly depends on many important factors such as duration and extent of cold stress, different plant growth stages and moisture content. The seedling growth is significantly affected by high frost stress ( $-16^{\circ}\text{C}$ ). The frost stress leads to wilting of leaves, bleaching, or in extreme cases can cause plant death. A significant level of difference in growth was found among spring, hybrid and winter types to cold stress. However, the response of hybrid and winter types remained the same (Fiebelkorn and Rahman, 2016). The wilting symptoms can cause loss of maximum water from cells. The blackened cotyledons and/or leaves of canola genotypes serve as indicator to frost damage. The canola is more sensitive at cotyledons stage than at three- to four-leaf stage. The slow growing seedling shows less susceptibility than that of rapid growing seeding canola genotypes (Sovero, 1993).

### Effect of drought stress on morpho-physiological characters of *Brassica* species

Drought is one of the most drastic abiotic stresses that damages agricultural crops affecting its development, growth and production (Micheletto et al., 2007). Drought stress in plants may result some physiological disorders such as reduction in photosynthesis and transpiration (Sarker et al., 2005). The drought decreases the average production rate of different crop species (Robertson & Holland, 2004). Plants react to water stress through a number of developmental, functional and biochemical changes. The tolerant canola genotypes have more ability for adapting themselves under drought condition. The genetic diversity of cultivated *Brassica napus* relatives provides valuable genes for improving this tolerance (Hosseini & Hassibi, 2011).

Nasri et al. (2008) studied drought stress that caused a significant reduction in the number of seeds per siliqua, number of siliquae per plant, 1000-seed weight, seed yield, seed oil content, and oil yield of five rapeseed cultivars. Sinaki et al. (2007) observed that low water stress at flowering stage decreased seed yield, the biological yield, and the number of siliquae per plant of important rapeseed cultivars. Stroehrer et al. (1995) reported that phenology of rapeseed affected seed quality characteristics such as protein and oil percentage and the quantity of glucosinolates under water stress condition. The main qualitative properties of rapeseed plants strongly affected by water deficit are oil and protein contents (Istanbulluoglu et al., 2010). Tesfamariam et al. (2010) found that the seed oil content of rapeseed plants was low due to water deficit at flower budding stage. Richards & Thurling (1978) observed variation in response to drought stress between and within species such as *B. rapa* and *B. napus*. They found that seed production and its components in different cultivars of *B. rapa* and, *B. napus* are significantly influenced by low water stress. Variation in drought tolerance cultivars or species has frequently attributed to differences in their time of ripening. Thurling (1974) suggested that *B. napus* may be more resistant to drought stress than that of *B. rapa* since it flowers later and stores less of its dry matter after flowering. Drought stress negatively affected many biological processes in plants including the reduction in photosynthesis, accumulation of dry matter, stomatal opening, and protein synthesis (Larcher, 2003; Ohashi et al., 2006). Drought causes disorganization of thylakoid membranes resulting in reduction in chlorophyll contents and the pigments (Ashraf & Harris, 2013).

## Development of transgenic abiotic stress tolerant *Brassica* species

In nature, plants produced tolerance to both types of biotic and abiotic stresses but it is a very slow process and some time these extreme stresses affect plants negatively. The transgenic plants expressing transgene show more abiotic stress tolerance as compared to non-transgenic plants (Shinwari et al., 1998; Kasuga et al., 1999; Maqbool et al., 2002; Ali et al., 2016). Transgenic plants against biotic and abiotic stress can be produced through several gene transfer approaches using *Agrobacterium*-mediated transfer; this will enhance tolerance against drought, salinity and low temperature in *Arabidopsis thaliana* (Kasuga et al., 1999). Agarwal et al. (2006) described that with recent advances in molecular biology have shown that several genes are induced under abiotic stress condition. These genes have been isolated, characterized and transformed to plants under the presence of specific induced or constitutive promoters. The resulted transgenic plants showed tolerance to these extreme environmental conditions and played important role in the improvement of sustainable agriculture. Many efficient, quick, direct and indirect transformation protocols have been developed to wide range of plant species (Kumar et al., 2014; Shah et al., 2015; Jan et al., 2016). Various transgenic *Brassica* species has been produced against these environmental extreme that shows tolerance as compared to non-transgenic plant. The detailed information of these transgenic *Brassica* species against abiotic stresses is shown in Table 1.

**Table 1** Transgenic *Brassica* species developed against abiotic stress through genetic modification

Transgenic Plant	Transgene	Against	References
<i>Brassica napus</i>	<i>BnSIP1-1</i>	Salt and Osmotic stress	Luo et al. (2017)
<i>Brassica napus</i>	Differentially expressed genes (DEGs)	Drought	Wang et al. (2017)
<i>Brassica juncea</i>	Glyoxalase I	Drought and salt stress	Rajwanshi et al. (2016)
<i>Brassica juncea</i> cv. Varuna	Lectin	Drought and salt stress	Kumar et al. (2015)
<i>Brassica napus</i>	<i>AtDWF4</i>	Drought and heat stress	Sahni et al. (2016)
<i>Brassica napus</i> Var. Wester	<i>DREB</i>	Salt stress	Qamarunnisa (2015)
<i>Brassica oleracea</i> var. botrytis	APX, SOD	Salt stress	Metwali et al. (2012)
<i>Brassica napus</i>	Vacuolar Na <sup>+</sup> /H <sup>+</sup> antiporter <i>BnNHX1</i>	Salt stress	Wang et al. (2004)
<i>Brassica napus</i>	Vacuolar Na <sup>+</sup> /H <sup>+</sup> antiporter <i>AtNHX1</i>	Salt stress	Zhang et al. (2001)
<i>Brassica napus</i>	<i>AtCBF1</i>	Frost stress	Jaglo et al. (2001)
<i>Brassica napus</i>	<i>BNCBF5/BNCBF17</i>	Frost stress	Savitch et al. (2005)
<i>Brassica napus</i>	<i>Coda</i>	Salt stress	Huang et al. (2000)
<i>B. juncea</i>	<i>Coda</i>	Salt stress	Prasad et al. (2000)
<i>B. oleracea</i>	<i>Beta</i>	Salt stress	Bhattacharya et al. (2004)
<i>B. campestris</i>	<i>Lea</i>	Drought and salt stress	Park et al. (2005)

## CONCLUSION

The drought, salt, frost and high temperature stresses significantly affect the morpho-physiological processes of some important *Brassica* species. Development and identification of abiotic stress tolerant cultivars are important economic goals for our globe. The morphological and agronomical study of *Brassica* species performing under environmental extremes could lead the research and development of new stress-tolerant cultivars. The genetic engineering approaches play a key role for the development of improved transgenic

*Brassica* species against wide range of abiotic stresses. The present study provided updated information about the toxic effects of abiotic stress on important *Brassica* species, detailed information of abiotic stress tolerant and non-tolerant *Brassica* species/genotypes and transgenic approaches against these stresses.

**Author Contribution Statement** Sohail Ahmad Jan, Nazma Bibi, Zabta Khan Shinwari, Sana Ullah and Abdul Qadir drafted the manuscript. Nadar Khan and Malik Ashiq Rabbani conceived the review, retrieved literature and also helped to draft the manuscript.

**Conflict of Interest** The authors declare that there is no conflict of interests regarding the publication of this article.

**Acknowledgements** The authors greatly acknowledge Mr. Nazir Ahmad, PhD student for their valuable suggestions in the preparation of this review article.

## REFERENCES

- Agarwal, P. K., Agarwal, P., Reddy, M. K., & Sopory, S. K. (2006). Role of DREB transcription factors in abiotic and biotic stress tolerance in plants. *Plant Cell Reports*, 25(12), 1263-1274.
- Alam, M. M., Nahar, K., Hasanuzzaman, M., & Fujita, M. (2014). Trehalose-induced drought stress tolerance: A comparative study among different *Brassica* species. *Plant Omics Journal*, 7(4), 271-283.
- Ali, N., Zada, A., Ali, M., & Hussain, Z. (2016). Isolation and identification of *Agrobacterium tumefaciens* from the galls of peach tree. *Journal of Rural Development and Agriculture*, 1(1), 39-48.
- Allakhverdiev, S. I., Sakamoto, A., Nishiyama, Y., Inaba, M., & Murata, N. (2000). Ionic and osmotic effects of NaCl-induced inactivation of photosystems I and II in *Synechococcus* sp. *Plant Physiology*, 123(3), 1047-1056.
- Almodares, A., Hadi, M. R., & Dosti, B. (2007). Effects of salt stress on germination percentage and seedling growth in sweet sorghum cultivars. *Journal of Biological Sciences*, 7, 1492-1495.
- Ahmad, P., Kumar, A., Ashraf, M., & Akram, N. A. (2012). Salt-induced changes in photosynthetic activity and oxidative defense system of three cultivars of mustard (*Brassica juncea* L.). *African Journal of Biotechnology*, 11(11), 2694-2703.
- Angadi, S. V., Cutforth, H. W., Miller, P. R., McConkey, B. G., Entz, M. H., Brandt, S. A., & Volkmar, K. M. (2000). Response of three *Brassica* species to high temperature stress during reproductive growth. *Canadian Journal of Plant Science*, 80(4), 693-701.
- Ashraf, M., & Harris, P. J. C. (2013). Photosynthesis under stressful environments: An overview. *Photosynthetica*, 51(2), 163-190.
- Bhattacharya, R. C., Maheswari, M., Dineshkumar, V., Kirti, P. B., Bhat, S. R., & Chopra, V. L. (2004). Transformation of *Brassica oleracea* var. capitata with bacterial *betA* gene enhances tolerance to salt stress. *Scientia Horticulturae*, 100(1), 215-227.
- Bybordi, A., Tabatabaei, S. J., & Ahmadev, A. (2010). Effects of salinity on fatty acid composition of canola (*Brassica napus* L.). *Journal of Food, Agriculture and Environment*, 8(1), 113-115.
- Biswas, A. K., Mannan, M. A., & Dash, P. K. (2016). Germination, growth and yield response of Kohlrabi, *Brassica oleracea* var. gongylodes L. to NaCl induced salinity stress. *Bioscience and Bioengineering Communications*, 2(1), 81-89.
- Claussen, W. (2005). Proline as a measure of stress in tomato plants. *Plant Science*, 168(1), 241-248.
- Dai, Q. L., Chen, C., Feng, B., Liu, T. T., Tian, X., Gong, Y. Y., & Du, S. Z. (2009). Effects of different NaCl concentration on the antioxidant enzymes in oilseed rape (*Brassica napus* L.) seedlings. *Plant Growth Regulation*, 59(3), 273-278.
- Deol, J. S., Shivanna, K. R., Prakash, S., Banga, S. S., & Robbelen, G. (2003). Enarthrocarpus lyratus-based cytoplasmic male sterility and fertility restorer system in *Brassica rapa*. *Plant Breeding*, 122(5), 438-440.
- Farhoudi, R., Modhej, A., & Jamshidi, A. R. (2015). Effect of salt stress on antioxidant activity and seedling growth of three canola (*Brassica napus* L.) cultivars. *WALIA Journal* 31(S1), 180-184.
- Fiebelkorn, D., & Rahman, M. (2016). Development of a protocol for frost-tolerance evaluation in rapeseed/canola (*Brassica napus* L.). *The Crop Journal*, 4(2), 147-152.
- Gupta, N. K., Agarwal, S., Agarwal, V. P., Nathawat, N. S., Gupta, S., & Singh, G. (2013). Effect of short-term heat stress on growth, physiology and antioxidative defence system in wheat seedlings. *Acta Physiologiae Plantarum*, 35(6), 1837-1842.

- Hasanuzzaman, M., Nahar, K., Hossain, M. S., Mahmud, J. A., Rahman, A., Inafuku, M., & Fujita, M. (2017). Coordinated actions of glyoxalase and antioxidant defense systems in conferring abiotic stress tolerance in plants. *International Journal of Molecular Sciences*, 18(1), 200-228.
- Hayat, S., Masood, A., Yusuf, M., Fariduddin, Q., & Ahmad, A. (2009). Growth of Indian mustard (*Brassica Juncea* L.) in response to salicylic acid under high-temperature stress. *Brazilian Journal of Plant Physiology*, 21(3), 187-195.
- Huang, J., Hirji, R., Adam, L., Rozwadowski, K. L., Hammerlindl, J. K., Keller, W. A., & Selvaraj, G. (2000). Genetic engineering of glycinebetaine production toward enhancing stress tolerance in plants: Metabolic limitations. *Plant Physiology*, 122(3), 747-756.
- Hosseini, M., & Hassibi, P. (2011). Effects of water deficit stress on several quantitative and qualitative characteristics of canola (*Brassica napus* L.) cultivars. *Notulae Scientia Biologicae*, 3(3), 120.
- Islam, M. M., & Karim, M. A. (2010). Evaluation of rice (*Oryza sativa* L.) genotypes at germination and early seedling stage for their tolerance to salinity. *The Agriculturists*, 8(2), 57-65.
- Ismaili, A., Salavati, A., & Mohammadi, P. P. (2015). A comparative proteomic analysis of responses to high temperature stress in hypocotyl of canola (*Brassica napus* L.). *Protein and Peptide Letters*, 22(3), 285-299.
- Istanbulluoglu, A., Arslan, B., Gocmen, E., Gezer, E., & Pasa, C. (2010). Effects of deficit irrigation regimes on the yield and growth of oilseed rape (*Brassica napus* L.). *Biosystems Engineering*, 105(3), 388-394.
- Jaglo, K. R., Kleff, S., Amundsen, K. L., Zhang, X., Haake, V., Zhang, J. Z., Deits, T., & Thomashow, M. F. (2001). Components of the Arabidopsis C-repeat/dehydration-responsive element binding factor cold-response pathway are conserved in *Brassica napus* and other plant species. *Plant Physiology*, 127(3), 910-917.
- Jan, S. A., Shinwari, Z. K., Shah, S. H., Shahzad, A., Zia, M. A., & Ahmad, N. (2016). *In-planta* transformation: Recent advances. *Romanian Biotechnological Letters*, 21(1), 11085-11091.
- Jan, S. A., Shinwari, Z. K., & Rabbani, M. A. (2016). Agro-Morphological and Physiological Responses of *Brassica rapa* Ecotypes to Salt Stress. *Pakistan Journal of Botany*, 48(4), 1379-1384.
- Jinling, M., Caiyen, C., & Li, G. (1997). Pollen selection for cold resistance at flowering time in *Brassica napus*. *Cruciferae Newsletter*, 19, 85-86.
- Kasuga, M., Liu, Q., Miura, S., Yamaguchi-Shinozaki, K., & Shinozaki, K. (1999). Improving plant drought, salt, and freezing tolerance by gene transfer of a single stress-inducible transcription factor. *Nature Biotechnology*, 17(3), 287-291.
- Kandil, A. A., Sharief, A. E., & Ola Shereif, S. A. (2016). Effect of salinity stress on seedlings parameters of some canola cultivars. *International Journal of Agronomy and Agricultural Research*, 8(2), 10-18.
- Kaya, M. D., Okcu, G., Atak, M., Cikili, Y., & Kolsarici, O. (2006). Seed treatments to overcome salt and drought stress during germination in sunflower (*Helianthus annuus* L.). *European Journal of Agronomy*, 24(4), 291-295.
- Kumar, D., Shekhar, S., Bisht, S., Kumar, V., Varma, A., & Kumar, M. (2015). Ectopic overexpression of lectin in transgenic *Brassica juncea* plants exhibit resistance to fungal phytopathogen and showed alleviation to salt and drought stress. *Journal of Bioengineering & Biomedical Science*, 5, 147.
- Kumar, T., Khan, M. R., Jan, S. A., Ahmad, N., Ali, N., Zia, M. A., & Ali, G. M. (2014). Efficient regeneration and genetic transformation of sugarcane with *AVP1* gene. *American-Eurasian Journal of Agricultural & Environmental Sciences*, 14(2), 165-171.
- Kumar, T., Khan, M. R., Jan, S. A., Ahmad, N., Ali, N., Zia, M. A., & Ali, G. M. (2014). Optimization of factors affecting *Agrobacterium* mediated transformation in sugarcane through axillary buds with *AVP1* gene against drought and salinity. *European Academic Research*, 11(2), 2308-2327.
- Kumar, D. (1995). Salt tolerance in oilseed *Brassicaceae*-present status and future prospects. *Plant Breeding*, 65(10), 1439-1477.
- Lakhdar, A., Rabhi, M., Ghnaya, T., Montemurro, F., Jedidi, N., & Abdelly, C. (2009). Effectiveness of compost use in salt-affected soil. *Journal of Hazardous Materials*, 171(1), 29-37.
- Larcher, W. (2003). *Physiological Plant Ecology* (4<sup>th</sup> ed.). Berlin, Germany: Springer.
- Lomonte, C., Doronila, A. I., Gregory, D., Baker, A. J., & Kolev, S. D. (2010). Phytotoxicity of biosolids and screening of selected plant species with potential for mercury phytoextraction. *Journal of Hazardous Materials*, 173(1), 494-501.
- Lopez-Berenguer, C., Martinez-Ballesta, M. C., Garcia-Viguera, C., & Carvajal, M. (2008). Leaf water balance mediated by aquaporins under salt stress and associated glucosinolate synthesis in broccoli. *Plant Science*, 174(3), 321-328.

- Lu, P., Sang, W. G., & Ma, K. P. (2008). Differential responses of the activities of antioxidant enzymes to thermal stresses between two invasive *Eupatorium* species in China. *Journal of Integrative Plant Biology*, 50(4), 393-401.
- Luo, J., Tang, S., Mei, F., Peng, X., Li, J., Li, X., & Wu, G. (2017). *BnSIP1-1*, a trihelix family gene, mediates abiotic stress tolerance and ABA signaling in *Brassica napus*. *Frontiers in Plant Science*, 8, 1-14.
- Maqbool, S., Zhong, H., El-Maghraby, Y., Ahmad, A., Chai, B., Wang, W., & Sticklen, M. (2002). Competence of oat (*Avena sativa* L.) shoot apical meristems for integrative transformation, inherited expression, and osmotic tolerance of transgenic lines containing *hva1*. *Theoretical and Applied Genetics*, 105(2-3), 201-208.
- Metwali, E. M. R., Fuller, M. P., & Jellings, A. J. (2012). Agrobacterium mediated transformation of anti-stress genes into cauliflower (*Brassica oleracea* var. botrytis L.). 2. Transformation and confirmation of stress tolerance. *Australian Journal of Basic and Applied Sciences*, 6(5), 31-39.
- Micheletto, S., Rodriguez-Urbe, L., Hernandez, R., Richins, R. D., Curry, J., & O'Connell, M. A. (2007). Comparative transcript profiling in roots of *Phaseolus acutifolius* and *P. vulgaris* under water deficit stress. *Plant Science*, 173(5), 510-520.
- Morrison, M. J., & Stewart, D. W. (2002). Heat stress during flowering in summer *Brassica*. *Crop Science*, 42(3), 797-803.
- Nasri, M., Khalatbari, M., Zahedi, H., Paknejad, F., & Moghadam, H. R. (2008). Evaluation of micro and macro elements in drought stress condition in cultivars of rapeseed (*Brassica napus* L.). *American Journal of Agricultural and Biological Sciences*, 3(3), 579-583.
- Nejat, N., & Mantri, N. (2017). Plant immune system: Crosstalk between responses to biotic and abiotic stresses the missing link in understanding plant defence. *Current Issue in Molecular Biology*, 23, 1-16.
- Oh, S., Moon, K. H., Son, I. C., Song, E. Y., Moon, Y. E., & Koh, S. C. (2014). Growth, photosynthesis and chlorophyll fluorescence of Chinese cabbage in response to high temperature. *Korean Journal of Horticultural Science & Technology*, 32(3), 318-329.
- Ohashi, Y., Nakayama, N., Saneoka, H., & Fujita, K. (2006). Effects of drought stress on photosynthetic gas exchange, chlorophyll fluorescence and stem diameter of soybean plants. *Biologia Plantarum*, 50(1), 138-141.
- Park, B. J., Liu, Z., Kanno, A., & Kameya, T. (2005). Genetic improvement of Chinese cabbage for salt and drought tolerance by constitutive expression of a *B. napus* *LEA* gene. *Plant Science*, 169(3), 553-558.
- Prasad, K. V. S. K., Sharmila, P., Kumar, P. A., & Saradhi, P. P. (2000). Transformation of *Brassica juncea* (L.) Czern with bacterial *codA* gene enhances its tolerance to salt stress. *Molecular Breeding*, 6(5), 489-499.
- Qamarunnisa, S., Jamil, I., Raza, S., Azhar, A., & Naqvi, S. H. M. (2015). Genetic improvement of canola against abiotic stress through incorporation of *DREB* gene. *Asian Journal of Agriculture and Biology*, 3(3), 77-104.
- Rajwanshi, R., Kumar, D., Yusuf, M. A., DebRoy, S., & Sarin, N. B. (2016). Stress-inducible overexpression of *glyoxalase I* is preferable to its constitutive overexpression for abiotic stress tolerance in transgenic *Brassica juncea*. *Molecular Breeding*, 36(6), 1-15.
- Richards, R. A., & Thurling, N. (1978). Variation between and within species of rapeseed (*Brassica campestris* and *B. napus*) in response to drought stress. I. Sensitivity at different stages of development. *Crop and Pasture Science*, 29(3), 469-477.
- Robertson, M. J., & Holland, J. F. (2004). Production risk of canola in the semi-arid subtropics of Australia. *Crop and Pasture Science*, 55(5), 525-538.
- Sahni, S., Prasad, B. P., Liu, Q., Grbic, V., Sharpe, A., Singh, S. P., & Krishna, P. (2016). Over-expression of the brassinosteroid biosynthetic gene *DWF4* in *Brassica napus* simultaneously increases seed yield and stress tolerance. *Scientific Reports*, 6, 28298.
- Sarker, B. C., Hara, M., & Uemura, M. (2005). Proline synthesis, physiological responses and biomass yield of eggplants during and after repetitive soil moisture stress. *Scientia Horticulturae*, 103(4), 387-402.
- Savitch, L. V., Allard, G., Seki, M., Robert, L. S., Tinker, N. A., Huner, N. P., & Singh, J. (2005). The effect of overexpression of two *Brassica* CBF/DREB1-like transcription factors on photosynthetic capacity and freezing tolerance in *Brassica napus*. *Plant and Cell Physiology*, 46(9), 1525-1539.
- Sergeeva, E., Shah, S., & Glick, B. R. (2006). Growth of transgenic canola (*Brassica napus* cv. Westar) expressing a bacterial 1-aminocyclopropane-1-carboxylate (ACC) deaminase gene on high concentrations of salt. *World Journal of Microbiology and Biotechnology*, 22(3), 277-282.

- Shah, S. H., Ali, S., Hussain, Z., Jan, S. A., Din, J. U., & Ali, G. M. (2016). Genetic improvement of tomato (*Solanum lycopersicum*) with *AtDREB1A* gene for cold stress tolerance using optimized *Agrobacterium*-mediated transformation system. *International Journal of Agriculture and Biology*, 18, 471–482.
- Shah, S. H., Ali, S., Jan, S. A., & Ali, G. M. (2015). Piercing and incubation method of in planta transformation producing stable transgenic plants by overexpressing *DREB1A* gene in tomato (*Solanum lycopersicum* Mill.). *Plant Cell, Tissue and Organ Culture*, 120(3), 1139-1157.
- Shinwari, Z. K., Nakashima, K., Miura, S., Kasuga, M., Seki, M., Yamaguchi-Shinozaki, K., & Shinozaki, K. (1998). An Arabidopsis gene family encoding DRE/CRT binding proteins involved in low-temperature-responsive gene expression. *Biochemical and Biophysical Research Communications*, 250(1), 161-170.
- Siddiqui, M. H., Mohammad, F., & Khan, M. N. (2009). Morphological and physio-biochemical characterization of *Brassica juncea* L. Czern. & Coss. genotypes under salt stress. *Journal of Plant Interactions*, 4(1), 67-80.
- Sinaki, J. M., Heravan, E. M., Ra, A. H. S., Noormohammadi, G., & Zarei, G. (2007). The effects of water deficit during growth stages of canola (*Brassica napus* L.). *American-Eurasian Journal of Agricultural and Environmental Sciences*, 4, 417-422.
- Singh, M., Rathore, S. S., & Raja, P. (2014). Physiological and Stress Studies of Different Rapeseed-mustard genotypes under terminal heat stress. *International Journal of Genetic Engineering and Biotechnology*, 5(2), 133-142.
- Singh, S. K., Kakani, V. G., Brand, D., Baldwin, B., & Reddy, K. R. (2008). Assessment of cold and heat tolerance of winter-grown canola (*Brassica napus* L.) cultivars by pollen-based parameters. *Journal of Agronomy and Crop Science*, 194(3), 225-236.
- Stroeher, V. L., Boothe, J. G., & Good, A. G. (1995). Molecular cloning and expression of a turgor-responsive gene in *Brassica napus*. *Plant Molecular Biology*, 27(3), 541-551.
- Sovero, M. (1993). Rapeseed, a new oilseed crop for the United States. In J. Janick & J. E. Simon (Eds.), *New Crops* (pp. 302–307). New York, NY: Wiley.
- Steinbrenner, A. D., Agerbirk, N., Orians, C. M., & Chew, F. S. (2012). Transient abiotic stresses lead to latent defense and reproductive responses over the *Brassica rapa* life cycle. *Chemoecology*, 22(4), 239-250.
- Su, J., Wu, S., Xu, Z., Qiu, S., Luo, T., Yang, Y., & Huang, B. (2013). Comparison of salt tolerance in *Brassicaceae* and some related species. *American Journal of Plant Sciences*, 4(10), 1911.
- Tesfamariam, E. H., Annandale, J. G., & Steyn, J. M. (2010). Water stress effects on winter canola growth and yield. *Agronomy Journal*, 102(2), 658-666.
- Thurling, N. (1974). Morphophysiological determinants of yield in rapeseed (*Brassica campestris* and *Brassica napus*). I. Growth and morphological characters. *Crop and Pasture Science*, 25(5), 697-710.
- Torabi, B., & Ardestani, F. G. (2013). Effect of salt and drought stresses on germination components in canola (*Brassica napus* L.). *International Journal of Agriculture and Crop Sciences*, 5(15), 1642.
- Umar, S., Diva, I., Anjum, N., Iqbal, M., Ahmad, I., & Pereira, E. (2011). Potassium-induced alleviation of salinity stress in *Brassica campestris* L. *Open Life Sciences*, 6(6), 1054-1063.
- Yang, Y., Zheng, Q., Liu, M., Long, X., Liu, Z., Shen, Q., & Guo, S. (2012). Difference in sodium spatial distribution in the shoot of two canola cultivars under saline stress. *Plant and Cell Physiology*, 53(6), 1083-1092.
- Wang, P., Yang, C., Chen, H., Song, C., Zhang, X., & Wang, D. (2017). Transcriptomic basis for drought-resistance in *Brassica napus* L. *Scientific Reports*, 7, 1-20
- Wang, J., Zuo, K., Wu, W., Song, J., Sun, X., Lin, J., Li, X., & Tang, K. (2004). Expression of a novel antiporter gene from *Brassica napus* resulted in enhanced salt tolerance in transgenic tobacco plants. *Biologia Plantarum*, 48(4), 509-515.
- Wang, W., Vinocur, B., & Altman, A. (2003). Plant responses to drought, salinity and extreme temperatures: Towards genetic engineering for stress tolerance. *Planta*, 218(1), 1-14.
- Zamani, Z., Nezami, M.T., Habibi, D., & Khorshidi, M. B. (2010). Effect of quantitative and qualitative performance of four canola cultivars (*Brassica napus* L.) to salinity conditions. *Advances in Environmental Biology*, 4(3), 422-427.
- Zhang, J., Jiang, F., Yang, P., Li, J., Yan, G., & Hu, L. (2015). Responses of canola (*Brassica napus* L.) cultivars under contrasting temperature regimes during early seedling growth stage as revealed by multiple physiological criteria. *Acta Physiologiae Plantarum*, 37(2), 1-10.
- Zhang, H. X., Hodson, J. N., Williams, J. P., & Blumwald, E. (2001). Engineering salt-tolerant *Brassica* plants: Characterization of yield and seed oil quality in transgenic plants with increased vacuolar sodium accumulation. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*, 98(22), 12832-12836.

Zheng, Q., Liu, L., Liu, Z., Chen, J., & Zhao, G. (2009). Comparison of the response of ion distribution in the tissues and cells of the succulent plants *Aloe vera* and *Salicornia europaea* to saline stress. *Journal of Plant Nutrition and Soil Science*, 172(6), 875-883.